'TOOLS for CLIL Language Teachers'

THIRD EXTERNAL EVALUATION REPORT

PRE-FINAL REPORT

ALB CONSEIL

April 2014

Multilateral Project 517543-LLP-2011-DK-KA2-KA2MP

**Key Activity 2 Languages Lifelong Learning Programme
DG Education and Culture - European Commission**

The project 'TOOLS for CLIL Teachers' 517543-LLP-2011-DK-KA2-KA2MP has been funded with support from the European Commission.

This external evaluation report reflects the views only of the author and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Angelica L. Bucur, Ec. MBA
ALB CONSEIL - Consultancy, services and support for European projects

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of the third report of the external evaluation is to identify and analyse the overall work progress and performance, the coherence with the original aims and contractual obligations, the quality of products and outcomes in the months after Interim report and the eventual areas for improvement during the last 3 months of the project's duration.

In order to address these areas the external evaluation team has continued to deploy the activities presented in the external evaluation plan and tables approved by the project. The methodology included the correlations between the observation of results and work, analysis of data and quality indicators and success criteria defined. The communication and evidence from the project were systematically reflected upon and included in the evaluation process.

Overall, during the months 15-27, following the Interim Report, the 'TOOLS' project has **achieved with quality the results** that had been set. The data obtained brings evidence of relevant results achieved in the main work-phases through continuous interactions and exchanges with teachers and students and stakeholders. These led to valuable software improvements, the increased quality of tools for learning processes, more resources for CLIL and languages teaching and successful impact of communication and exploitation.

The **partnership** has continued to be a key strength of this well organised and dynamic project. The partners took the communication and exploitation of the projects results even higher, reaching as planned participants on the local level to the international level.

The project is engaged in promoting free on-line language teaching tools, service, CLIL resources and units, and platforms for communication and participation to development of quality of educational practices and materials through the actions of teachers and students. **Key achievement** towards the end of the funded period, is the **support offered** by TOOLS partners to target **end-users** and all the participants, with **numerous opportunities to learn, create, discuss, collaborate and share** CLIL materials and teaching resources.

The main **planned** outcomes **are developed in time**, linked with work-plan and milestones. The online service, tools and availability on iPad and smartphone platforms have been successfully piloted, tested and validated by users from the target sectors higher education,

vocational education and training and adult education. The last activities to deploy until the the TOOLS system is reaching the state-of-art, are currently promoting the last on-line courses, teachers registrations for these courses until May 15 and providing the final courses.

The **clarity of vision of the needs** for CLIL authentic materials and lessons plans , thus for the project's outcomes is backed by success indicators. One quantitative **indicator** shows the interest in creating **learning units. + 950 multimedia CLIL units in +22 languages, covering the** CEFR levels, were **were produced by users or partners.**
Teachers and students used an improved **Clilstore** to produce easier the learning resources with text and multimedia interactive features, images/graphics, audio, video, Internet sources.

The ever increased **dissemination and exploitation activities** and channels continued to be based on **good practice** that contribute to learning processes. The partners have organised numerous workshops, seminars and specific courses that enhanced teachers competences and collaboration.

The presentations at national, European and international conferences, the academic papers published or to be submitted, are aimed at disseminating TOOLS ideas and emerging trends in CLIL, or from other domains applying, like arts curation, materials nudgeting, and also other European projects.

The project's results in these areas, up to month 27 contribute already to the setting-up of **sustainability through further communications and networking**. The activities range from involving teachers, trainees, students in concrete use and creation of CLIL resources, to reaching the education and training public bodies, networking on national and international levels with other projects, including the POOLS projects CLIL4U and METHODS.

The main recommendations are:
− to make more visible the learning experience of users from the feedback or evaluations of TOOLS by the participants to courses and workshops
− the Clilstore system is almost in the final state-of-art , the security issues raised should be covered to ensure the stability of the system.
− the partners should ensure the time to fully document all final results, dissemination and exploitation activities, sustainability and of the additional dissemination activities.

SCOPE OF THE THIRD EXTERNAL EVALUATION REPORT

The external evaluation instruments and methods have been consistent during the second part of the project lifetime with methodology used in our initial and interim external evaluation reports that assessed TOOLS project activities and the progress towards original aims. Complementing the internal ongoing monitoring and quality assurance plan of the project, the external evaluation provided additional evidence and feedback at Interim Report time on the overall very good progress and quality of the achievements of effective transnational collaboration and inclusion of the target groups in activities, with high effectiveness and impact of dissemination and exploitation activities.

The project TOOLS for CLIL Teachers obtained the Grade 9 /10 at the Interim Time, with grades of 9 in six of the criteria and the maximum grade 10 in dissemination and exploitation. There were no recommendations for improvement.

The **scope** of the third report is to provide a qualitative evaluation of results, feedback and recommendations for the final report time.

The **duration** covered by this report is from April 2013 to April 2014. The external evaluation includes supporting evidence for the accomplishments at three months from the end of the EU-funded duration.

SOURCES OF INFORMATION USED

Original application, work-plan, budget, Internal collaboration procedures, internal work procedures, decisions and additional activities approved during the project's meetings 4 in Evora and meeting 5 in Belfast, the internal evaluations by partners, on-going evaluation of on-line system, learning units and results produced or in progress, training courses, the respect of key milestones defined for TOOLS activities and the accomplished tasks; dissemination and exploitation, papers, presentations, the evidence of activities and impact at local, national and EU levels, FB postings, messages, education sources, e-mails exchanges, papers written and published, website, statistics, Newsletters, participation to 3 meetings, testing the tools and the Clistore system.

A final **external evaluation questionnaire** was presented during the Belfast meeting (April 10th, 2014) will be distributed mid-June 2014 to TOOLS partners. The results and statistics will be included in an annex to the fourth final external evaluation report that will take in account the achievements of TOOLS during the whole 30 months duration.

EXTERNAL EVALUATION FINDINGS AND RESULTS

The following sections present the findings, conclusions and supporting evidence from the internal documentation of the project, from the project's website and other available e-platform and sources.

The collaboration, organization and implementation of project activities, the results of work-processes and the quality and relevance of the outcomes produced have been observed, monitored and evaluated periodically the last 12 months. As before, the coherence between the activities and results have been checked with the original planning. The quality of the achievements was evaluated and compared with the indicators and success criteria in each of the Work-Packages.

Very useful and rewarding were the discussions, exchanges with the project participants and other project stakeholders during the participation of the external evaluator for monitoring of the fourth project meeting at the University of Evora, Portugal in 2013 and fifth meeting at Ulster University in Belfast , UK in April 2014.

MANAGEMENT, QUALITY ASSURANCE, PARTNERSHIP

The WP 1 Project Coordination (PM), the WP2 Quality Assurance (QA) and the WP3 Internet-based collaboration (COM) have a 30-month duration.

From the very beginning, the management procedures, and project documentation, financial templates and time-sheets were produced and all available on the TOOLS website. Other tools and systems are used and have been supporting an effective collaboration among partners. The organization and use of a Dropbox file system for content sharing, use of social

networks Facebook and blog for dissemination and advertising, e-mails, exchanges and work-groups during the face-to-face projects meetings for bilateral and multilateral communication.

The work-environment and communication platforms are set-up on the project's main website http://www.languages.dk/tools/ to ensure the transparent communication, information with all project partners. The information and all the results and work-in progress, the evaluations and the results, all these are also visible and accessible to all the external audiences. It is a model of Nordic countries inspiration that transfers good practice of public funding transparency , promote the access of all documents, including the internal documents that can be considered confidential such as the original application, budget or evaluation and feedback from the EACEA. In the assessment of the Interim Report, the EACEA independent expert pointed out to only one weakness, that related to the open and transparent communication on the TOOLS website of all internal information and suggested that the partnership might want to reconsider this policy. We observed that the open communication policy on the project's website has been followed successfully for years and reached now +120.000 unique visitors, without encountering problems, and no hiking or spams. In addition, it might have increased reach of the WP3 communication and impact of the dissemination using the website.

The coordination and internal monitoring of the project progress are on-going activities with bi-annual reports of activity by each of the partners. These periodic evaluations allow to check, evaluate the quality and control of the progress of the project with respect to the contractual work-plan and identify the variations or additional results. The internal bi-annual reports 1, 2, 3, 4 covering the first 24 months were timely delivered and are available at: http://www.languages.dk/archive.html#Ongoing_tools_project_evaluation

The shared management and the coordination by the P1 SDE included the good keeping records of work-processes, minutes of the meetings and track of main decisions for implementation of the activities with the respect of the set deadlines. Ensuring communication with the European Commission and the Executive Agency in Brussels are the responsibilities of the Danish Coordinator. Kent Andersen has always performed these activities with additional value by using them as opportunities for dissemination of the results. He acted pro-actively from the beginning , disseminating the information about Tools, brochures, posters and later on the DVDs to the other coordinators during the participation to the Coordinators' meetings organized by EACEA in Brussels.

An important aspect of the WP1 is the control of the expenditures according to the budget. This is also done on a bi-annual basis with the fill-in of the time-sheets and corresponding activities of the participants to the project. At each of the f2f meetings, a part is led by the Financial department representative of P1, dedicated to the check, assessment and control of the expenses and proofs of the costs.

The quality assurance in WP2 has continued to be efficiently ensured on multiple levels and internal and external activities. The external evaluations by the target-beneficiaries were at the core of the project. The feedback from the activities of piloting with the target beneficiaries was beneficial for the improvement of the system and tools Multidict and Wordlink.

The **results of WP1 and WP2 and WP3** with **efficient collaboration and implementation of project management and quality assurance from** the beginning to April 2014 are straightforward : **the work-progress is well in-line with the contractual work-plan** .

THE PARTNERSHIP

The project has continued to be developed with quality and high impact by the Consortium of eight partners from Denmark, Lithuania, Portugal, Spain and UK. The partner institutions are covering the needed sectors Higher Education, VET and College levels, allowing for a cross-sectoral educational testing.

TOOLS partnership continued their effective European transnational collaboration and communication with teachers, students, other users and stakeholders. We used the project's website, the Facebook, the blog and the e-mails, the bi-annual activity reports of the partners, the minutes of the meetings to monitor and analyse the on-going development and delivery of work by the partners.

The findings show that there are no delays and all **the planned tasks and activities of the partners were delivered successfully** by the beginning of April 2014. The remaining tasks and activities can be delivered as planned in the last months of activities.

Another positive aspect is that some **additional activities were decided** and can be delivered within the original budget. It was approved and budgeted that the Portuguese members from Universidade de Evora and from the Danish University of Southern Denmark can travel and make more presentations of TOOLS for CLIL language teaching/learning, disseminating to additional relevant institutions in Portugal and Sweden.

The last two project meetings in Evora – September 2013 and Belfast – April 2014, to which we participated were perfect opportunities to observe and evaluate their collaboration to activities, the **synergies and the results the creative exchanges within the partnership**.

For example, the additional dissemination or exploitation activities through pilot courses, presented above, were decided during the final TOOLS meeting taking place in Belfast – April 8-11 2014. The leader of the SDU team, Helle Lykke Nielsen found that she already **reached all the 74 teachers of Arabic that teach in Denmark** in the pilot courses organized for teachers which exceeds the planned 73 teachers/country. Some teachers of Arabic have started using CLILstore units as a part of their teaching. These are very good results and in-line with the original aims to involve with quality a relevant number of teachers in the pilot testing. However, she decided to present TOOLS also to teachers of Arabic that teach in Sweden and increase the numbers of Arabic teachers reached and in the same time reach additional language.

The **same pro-active attitude had the Portuguese team from Evora**, with Maria Joao Marcalo and Ana de Silva that undertook to travel to the islands to deliver additional courses to the more difficult to reach teachers.

The partners that organized the project's meetings during the second period, Universidade de Evora in Portugal and University of Ulster - Belfast Campus UK, were excellent hosts. They took care of every detail to ensure the smooth running of the meetings and workshops, reserving time for the cultural exchanges and planning activities for the participants.

We observed these two meetings in the second period. It is why we would like to highlight that only a part of the time spent and energy of the organizers can be retrieved in time-sheets.

The feedback for the reaming months is that the partnership continued to be a key strength of the project. The partners have contributed to project management, equality assurance, the development, testing of all main results, to dissemination and dissemination, in line with the planned tasks. Teachers from outside the partnership were invited and attended the CALL development and methodology courses and started using the online development system and employ the outcomes with their students.

The examples of hard work, synergies and commitment to produce quality results, additional results are numerous and each TOOLS partner delivered them. Each of the partners has been providing support to teachers and students, to other audiences and users with a positive impact on teaching and learning languages.

We will present more examples in the fourth and Final Report the evidence of the innovative aspects of the work and reach and impact of the final deliverables of the participants to the TOOLS project.

DEVEVELOPMENT, TESTING, EXPLOITATION RESULTS IN WP6, WP7, WP8

The project TOOLS made a **quality leap** towards reaching its final goal – to develop and offer a free online Clilstore service, where language teachers can author online multimedia learning units, with all words in a text automatically linked through **Wordlink tool** to online dictionaries with a selection of +100 languages via **Multidict tool**.

An important role in the last developments of the system had the intense testing, piloting with users and teachers training organized with the target-users and the evaluations performed. As planned in application, and sometimes going beyond the expectations, the partners took all the opportunities to test Clilstore with a diversity of target groups representing the contractual education sectors. They reached and involved in piloting teachers and students from their own institutions or audiences from the European or international conferences, workshops and other events to which the partners participated. The feedback from users and partners to address technical problems, improvement of design or pedagogic issues were analysed and many taken on board. Suggestions for improvements were answered at the best with the possibilities offered by the new software versions or functionalities updated.

For instance, from a point of view of authoring pedagogic units, the system Clilstore facilitates now the creation by the users – teachers, students, with a WYSIWYG editor (What You See Is What You Get). This useful feature allows the authors to add videos, sound, and graphics wherever they need in their text, without 'resorting to HTML coding'.

On April 4th, 2014, Caoimhín Ó Donnaíle, the Tools software developer published news of the progress towards to more user friendly Clilstore system and service: '*If you have a look at unit 1835 ....you'll see that I have been making some good progress with giving Clilstore the ability to store files attached to units, rather than authors having to store them on Dropbox or elsewhere....So the new facility could potentially provide great benefits and simplifications. There are two problems, though. One is that I have not yet provided any mechanism for authors to upload files such as this to Clilstore! So the facility is not yet available for use. The files in the test unit I uploaded by hand into the database. However, it should not be too*

difficult to provide some kind of upload facility for authors. ..other problem is ...store files with JavaScript which could attempt to exploit weakness in the computer '.

During the Belfast meeting, the partners discussed the stem and tools improvements and the last changes that should be done to the system before its final version.

The challenges highlighted by Caoimhín, such as ensuring the security of the system that could be attacked now that the CLIL units can contain now more than text, i.e. exercises with uploaded files and embedded programmes, other possible threats announcing the on-line courses were discussed.

Solutions to prevent some threats were presented by the software developer and some were discussed in Belfast.

More evidence was analysed of how the students and teachers used **the CLILstore service to create multimedia rich learning units**. The previous **evaluation questionnaire** showed that the users graded the usability and facilities offered by Clilstore with top grades of **5 (excellent) and 4 (very good)**, on a scale from 1 to 5.

The **learning challenges and achievements using TOOLS Clilstore** service in the specific context of Irish language undergraduate programme were analysed in the paper '**Multimedia-assisted content and language integrated learning' by Caoimhín Ó Dónaill from University of Ulster,** published in *Multimedia-Assisted Language Learning, 16*(4), 11-38. The evaluation by the 23 students involved in the lab testing had positive results.

In August 2013 the TOOLS partners from SDE College, University of Ulster and Universitat Politècnica de València delivered a two week teacher training course in Malta entitled CLIL Tools and applications for teachers working with CLIL. Targeting both Comenius and Grundtvig teachers, TOOLS reached +30 participants in the training from the primary, secondary and vocational sectors from 9 EU countries and Russia. In addition to creating CLIL units, the participants gave feedback and reflected on how the use in their specific pedagogical context and on lesson plans for practice in their classroom.

Other courses and workshops and evaluations were organized in Evora, Portugal by the 3 Professors from University of Evora, in Denmark by the two institutions partners, in UK by the two educational institutions partners, on international level by Prof. Ana Gimenez from University of Valencia, and of course through EUROCALL partner during the annual Conferences.

Other new additional domains were explored like training students interpreters in Lithuania or innovative methodologies for ensuring the quality of the CLIL materials were developed and presented.

The core outcome of the project TOOLS, Clilstore contains at the time of writing this report +950 teaching units for Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL), an increase of 30% in the last 12 months. The CLIL units have been continued to be created and / or evaluated by a relevant number of teachers and learners. Based on feedback from the end-beneficiaries, analysis and discussion in the partnership of the recommendations for improvements, new functionalities have been developed.

COMMUNICATION AND DISSEMINATION RESULTS IN WP3, WP4, WP 10 , WP11

The overall local, national, transnational and Internet-based dissemination activities continue to be outstanding results after the 27 months. The impact was enhanced by twinning some the dissemination with exploitation activities.

After the very good results at Interim time, the effectiveness and impact of the communication and dissemination activities were further increased.

They are supported by quantitative **indicators** highlighting again **the impact** of the project . For the **website impact,** the last months 15-27 analysed here, the number of daily unique visitors on the website **http://www.languages.dk/tools/** were in average between 300 and 720. End of April 2014 ,with **total hits of + 246.599,** from the +141.368 hits in March 2012, a raise of + 140.000 users in last 2 years.

The communication and availability of results and newsletters on the website were complemented by a good use of the Facebook group, Twitter account, the Wordpress Blog.

We highlight here only the most important international or EU events in the fall of 2013 where TOOLS partnership and products have benefited probably from a maximum 'visibility' and were able to communicate the TOOLS vision and aims to a diversity of teachers and potential stakeholders from many sectors of education and many countries.

In September 2013, the partner University of Evora hosted the the 20th Eurocall European Conference 'Learning from the Past, Looking to the Future' and presented TOOLS achievements and objectives to the +150 researchers and teachers of languages.

In October 2013, Tools participated in Athens at the EfVET 2013 European conference with pretensions of the tools and Clilstore service for language teaching/learning, TOOLS Teachers Guide and the Do-It-Yourself videos in 7 languages. The workshop was delivered

by the languages teachers Rasa Zymantaite, leading partner from Lithuania and Kent Andersen, the TOOLS leader and coordinator.

Other excellent opportunity for dissemination and networking was in Graz, Austria in December 2013 where Rasa attended the networking meeting of the project "Language for work", implemented by the European Centre for Modern Languages, a department within the EU Council Directorate General IV- Education, Culture and Heritage, Youth and Sport.

Professor Ana Gimeno participated in November 2013 the 21st International Conference on Computers in Education in Indonesia, organised by the Asia Pacific Society for Computers in Education.

The partners are compiling the final evidence of their dissemination on local, regional and EU and international levels. As presented in the beginning, additional activities were budgeted for in the last months for Portuguese and Danish partners.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The project has continued to ensure a **dynamic work progress.** The activities, the results and useful resources, the overall achievements during the 27 months of activity are all in very good relationship with the original aims. There are no deviations from work-plan. The changes decided are positive and allow for additional activities and impact.

From a development point of view, towards the end of the EU-funded lifetime of the project, there is an on-going demonstration of the TOOLS partners commitment to meet the end-beneficiaries needs and promote and disseminate the CLIL authoring system and authentic materials.

The system and tools technical functionalities were well improved and became really user-friendly. The design and layout were improved. Currently the Clilstore system can be still developed but only minor changes are foreseen before the end of June 2014. This is a very good decision to ensure the stability of the tested system and service.

There is a need to continue to work on the challenges and security issues arising from the new functionalities allowing for Javascript. A good solution is indeed to create as soon as possible filters to block files .exe or .bat. We recommend to form a working-group to find the best ways to prevent them also after the end of the funded life.

The project partners reached and involved the target-beneficiaries and already ensured the transversal character to the three education sectors.

The TOOLS for CLIL workshops and presentations for teachers were quality achievements.

The evaluation by users highlighted overall added-value of the TOOLS for the learning and teaching languages.

A clear analysis and evidence of the learning value currently available is provided by C. O Donnaile from the University of Ulster, cited in the previous pages:

'*...using Clilstore units in a technology rich learning environment provides a very effective means of introducing and processing new content, and that the inherent emphasis placed on dictionary consultation by individual users generally leads to a productive and positive learning experience*.'

We recommend that more partners comment for the Final report time on the learning experience of the users – teachers and students, in addition of the interesting data obtained from the questionnaires applied.

The joint contribution of partners to the development of outcomes, the collaborative and friendly collaboration were key to the continuous delivery with success of TOOLS results.

Together, using all the dissemination and exploitation means and channels ensured the continuous effectiveness of the activities to reach and inform a wide range of the project's beneficiaries, other end-user and reach policy and institutional decision-making and other stakeholders in the European Union and beyond.

We recommend to present at the Final Report time the evidence of all these outstanding activities and impact.

April 30, 2014

by Angelica L. Bucur, Ec. MBA, External evaluator
ALB CONSEIL - Consultancy, services and support for European projects.